

March 30, 2011

Fruits of Ethiopia Part 2: Cases, Orphanages, and Analyses

As hard as this may be, adopting parents need to understand what they can and cannot control about the adoption process itself. Particularly difficult to believe is that they will have no control over how orphanages operate or how in-country regulations are implemented. Instead, they are guided by their adoption agency, which may or may not even understand what is going on within the process (and, frankly, which may not particularly care to know). This, unfortunately, places the onus on the adopting parent to figure out the process and the players, both here and abroad. We hope that this post helps to explain the connections between the orphanages and their operations.

REFORM Talk previously covered the Background (<http://reformtalk.blogspot.com/2011/03/ethiopia-looking-at-past-to-understand.html>) and the first third (<http://reformtalk.blogspot.com/2011/03/fruits-of-ethiopia-report.html>) of the Fruits of Ethiopia 2009 report, released to the public in February 2011. This post will analyze and share excerpts from the rest of the report.

Nineteen birth family interviews were conducted between mid-August and September 1, 2009. The interviews were between twenty minutes and one and a half hours in length.

The objective of the interviews was to “actually find out whether the biological families had really understood the full consequences of relinquishment of their child for (inter-country) adoption - meaning the permanent termination of all legal and social ties with the child.” This information was not able to be obtained in such short interviews because it “was felt simply to be inappropriate and too hurtful for the biological families to confront them with the full reality of inter-country adoption, i.e. that they had permanently lost all ties with their child.”

This report, due to its limitations, could not conclude that the Ethiopian adoption program was unclean. “No evidence that money had been paid directly to birth families was found. However, in some cases there are indications that intermediaries received money in exchange for the children and smaller amounts were received by the birth family under the heading of transportation costs. Further research into this matter would be needed before final conclusions can be made.” **This absence of data does not equal verification of facts.**

Pages 45-82 reveal each individual Ethiopia to Netherlands adoption case, 19 in total. All of the results are grim. We have made a 4-page at-a-glance table of the cases here (<https://acrobat.com/#d=hG7FDWjB0DKxSdxT1d7lAg>)

Keeping the family together or offering care *in* Ethiopia did not occur. This is important to realize because there seems to be a profound disconnect between *who* is getting offered family preservation services. **It is NOT enough for an agency to claim they have a family preservation branch if they are not actively offering preservation possibilities to EVERY child that comes onto the international adoption agency radar. Not offering family preservation to families who have children in the preferred prospective adoptive parent range (young, healthy females) should be viewed as suspect.**



March 30, 2011

Fruits Orphanages

Each orphanage we discuss from this point forward is color-coded to help you identify the links more clearly.

The *Fruits of Ethiopia* Orphanage breakdown is as follows:

Cases 1, 10, 11, 14	Gelgela
Cases 2-5, 8-9, 16, 18	Sele Enat
Cases 6, 15	Bethzatha (also spelled as Bethsaid, Bethezata, Betezatha, Betezieda and Bethsaida)
Cases 7, 12-13, 17, 19	Fenot Lewogen

Issues and Connections in Fruits Report

There are 5 crucial orphanage issues and connections that need to be highlighted to show the scope of the problem:

- (1) Case 10 **Gelgela** 2008 the birthmother's cousin "worked at that time for **Gelgela** and now works for **Bethezata**... She told us that **Bethzatha** employs for a monthly salary (around 400 Birr) people in the villages to find children for adoption."

Case 14 **Gelgela** 2007 "minibus from Addis and collect children to bring them to Addis with nannies."

Connections: between employees at **Gelgela** and **Bethzatha**. There is harvesting at Bethezata. See US Agency section below for more about CHSFS, BFAS, AGCI, WACAP, Children's Hope and Holt and affiliation with **Bethzatha** orphanage and CWA, Bethany and AWAA affiliation with **Gelgela**

- (2) Case 13 **Fenot Lewogen** 2007, the birth father says he got "one time a picture of the child from **Gelgela**" so **Fenot Lewogen** children were transferred from **Gelgela**.

Connections: This orphanage transferred kids to **Gelgela**. See US Agency section below for more about CWA, Bethany and AWAA affiliation with **Gelgela**. Why is this important? The sharing of these kids among orphanages means many orphanages and their workers need closer scrutiny.



March 30, 2011

- (3) Case 18 **Sele Enat** 2004 Harvesting is indicated. "**Wereldkinderen's Ethiopian Representative requested at that time eight children from the Village for Wereldkinderen and they had gathered six children and asked her to give her child for adoption too. Within three days she had to decide.**"

Connections: See US Agency section below for more about IAN and AAI (WA) affiliation with **Sele Enat**.

- (4) Case 5 **Sele Enat** 2005- One paper being re-used for 8 children to declare them orphans indicates children are being laundered as "orphans" **at the orphanage level**. "OSSA who was writing the single paper for Seleentorphanage saying orphaned children who needs help for many children at one paper without background information"

Connections: See US Agency section below for more about IAN and AAI (WA) affiliation with **Sele Enat**.

- (5) Page 116 is a ruling from **2001** about 5 orphanages with high abandonment rates. "This is a special bench which sees cases relating to adoption. Most of these children are given for adoption by the government and private orphanages."

For the past six months the cases that were brought to the court were about children that have parents, but their parents couldn't raise them, so the court would summon those parents to come in person and express their consent. Now, most of the new files are about children that were abandoned. Most of the children are abandoned in similar places and then placed in a few select orphanages. In order to confirm the stories the court believes additional investigations need to be done. Alerting the police to fragile nature of the case, the court ordered Addis Ababa Police to investigate the case and annexed documents that show the number of abandoned children in the last month that were given to orphanages by police.

The orphanages that opened files stating police placed children because they were found abandoned are:

1. Kidest Mariam Orphanage
2. **Edget Orphanage**
3. **Birhan Family Welfare Foundation**
4. **Enat Alem Children Aid**
5. **Betzatha Orphanage**

Connections: It is important to note that a high abandonment rate was a major contributing factor for the questions asked in mid-2010. This means that agency and orphanage self-policing have not cleaned up procedures since 2001.



March 30, 2011

Multiple Orphanages, Same Agency

One of the arguments to keep Ethiopia adoptions flowing at their ever-increasing rate is due to an assumption that ethical issues are not widespread. Many prospective and adoptive parents have determined through their “research” (or their denial) that there are only a few “bad apple” agencies.

It is telling that the *Fruits* report shows how many corruption issues occurred in **multiple** orphanages. Not only did Wereldkinderen have relationships with multiple orphanages, many, if not all, US agencies also have **multiple** orphanage relationships. In fact, in their Ethica agency questionnaire (link <http://www.ethicanet.org/ethiopiasurveys/CHSFS.pdf>) from 2010, CHSFS stated, “We understand that Ethiopian law requires an orphanage to work with more than one adoption service provider.”

If Ethiopian law requires that orphanages work with more than one agency, is it reasonable to believe that if one agency has problems with an orphanage, then perhaps all agencies with a particular orphanage have issues?

To further confuse matters, the names of orphanages change quite a bit. For example “Sele Enat” to “ENAT HIV” to “AHope”; and “Bethzatha” to “Mussie/Mussey.”

Problems at the orphanage level must be considered.

US Agencies

The truth is that there is a hazy web of relationships among orphanages and US adoption agencies; among US sponsorship subsidiaries and US adoption agencies; and among orphanages and non-US adoption agencies.

MOWA has recently stated that they will reduce case reviews to 5 per day. Soon after this announcement, rumors of their playing catch-up with the paperwork backlog (leading to them processing an unprecedented 800 cases in a few weeks) started spreading. If this information is true, it is a terrible indication that lip service is being paid to corruption rather than a sincere desire to get to the root of the problems.

The following listing will show the SCOPE of the multiple relationships among US agencies and orphanages. It is crystal clear that this is a systemic, egregiously out-of-control problem. So while the cases in *Fruits of Ethiopia* were NOT from US agencies, it is important to understand that **multiple countries operate out of the same orphanages**. It should at the very least raise red flags in the minds of anyone preparing to adopt from Ethiopia that the orphanages exposed in the *Fruits* report are THE SAME ORPHANAGES supplying children for American PAPs, too.

Links about agency-orphanage connections are hiding in plain sight on the internet. ***When all of these connections and the Fruits report are put together, it paints a disturbing picture of what is really going on in Ethiopian orphanages. These issues are in desperate need for further, extensive investigation.***



March 30, 2011

Partial list of agencies and orphanages they work with:

Gladney	Kebebe Tsehay Orphanage, Ketchene Orphanage, Kolfe Youth Center
AAI (Washington)	Sele Enat, Kebebe Tsehay Orphanage
CWA	Gelgela (Australian expose)
Bethany	Gelgela
AWAA	Gelgela
IAN	Sele Enat
CHSFS	Bethzatha
BFAS	Bethzatha
AGCI	Bethzatha
WACAP	Bethzatha
Holt	Bethzatha
Children's Hope	Bethzatha, Fenot Lewogen, Enat Alem
AAI (Michigan)	Enat Alem

Specific agency links by Orphanage

Gelgela

Gelgela in particular has had documented major issues. See <http://pear-now.blogspot.com/2010/03/ethiopia-gelgela-orphanage.html>.

“PEAR put a call out to various organizations and individuals requesting a list of agencies that refer children from **Gelgela**. The European NGO, ACT (Against Child Trafficking - <http://againstchildtrafficking.org/>), provided us with the following list which they compiled from public records:



March 30, 2011

United States:

Bethany (partners with FTIA) ***

Christian World Adoption

America World Adoption

*** FTIA says no kids have come from **Gelgela**

Sele Enat

Sele Enat with 2005 manufacturing of orphans and 2004 harvesting

IAN

Multiple AP blogs and IAN's own blog cite IAN as working with **Sele Enat**

<http://adoptian.blogspot.com/2009/04/support-sele-enat.html>

AAI (Washington) AAI's blog confirms that they donations and aid went to **Sele Enat** in 2009

<http://aainews.blogspot.com/2009/09/new-years-sheep-delivery.html>

A March 2010 article indicates that they work with 10-15 orphanages

<http://www.saratogian.com/articles/2010/03/14/news/doc4b9c4de2693da722431941.txt?viewmode=3>

ENAT HIV 2004 **now AHope** <http://www.ahopeforchildren.org/history.html>

Sele Enat is affiliated with **Layla House** 2006 <http://5mceckids.blogspot.com/2006/04/sele-enat.html>

Sele Enat and HIV, same as **Enat HIV** same as **Sele Enate Mahiber**

<http://seleenat.com/hivkids.html>

<http://poundpuplegacy.org/node/20350> files on **Sele Enat**

Bethzatha

Bethzatha (multiple spellings like Bethzata, Bete Said, Betesaida) Bethzatha Children's Home Association-Known for harvesting children and sharing of employees with **Gelgela**.

The orphanage website- <http://d7347101.u33.greenroo.com/aboutus.html> says “**Bethzatha Children's Home Association (BCHA)** is a growing local based not for profit, non-governmental organisation (public health charity) legally established March 8, 2006 and obtained certificate of registration No. 26023 from Ministry of Justice, run by a board of Directors.



March 30, 2011

BCHA works in a community development, foster care, sponsorship program and adoption services in Ethiopia. When the project started its activities, **BCHA** has worked in Addis Ababa and surroundings but now due to the emerged problem of orphaned and abandoned children in Ethiopia, **BCHA** expanded its working area to Kembata, Tembaro, Hadiya, Sidama, Gedio, Wolayita and Arbaminch and Adama, Assela, West Showa, Jimma and Tigray”

“Regions and *Zones* **BCHA** work in (map at link <http://d7347101.u33.greenroo.com/locations.html>)

in Oromiya: - Adama [Nazareth], East Shewa, Assella, Jimma in South Nations and Nationalities and Peoples Region (SNNPR): *Hadiya, Kembata Tembaro, Wolayita, Sidama, Gedio, Gamo Goffa and Bonga* in Tigray:-*Mekele, Seharti Samre, and Tembey* as well as in Addis Ababa, the capital city of Ethiopia.”

CHSFS website claims multiple orphanage relationship. Feb 2007 blog http://michaelandmicheleadopt.blogspot.com/2007_02_01_archive.html “In the last newsletter from our agency, they stated that they have (and I quote) a new facility called "**Bethzatha**" which will provide housing, medical care and education for children with a variety of developmental and medical conditions including HIV/AIDS. **Bethzatha** will care for approximately 70 children, both eligible and non-eligible for adoption”

CHSFS Forums <http://chsfsforums.websitetoolbox.com/post?id=3701796&goto=nextoldest> Oct 2009” I just checked my notes from the trip, and the Hosanna orphanage/care center we visited in June, 2008, was DEFINITELY called **Bathzantha**”

Additionally, the Trail of Bethzatha to Mussie and the “repetitive movement of the same staff between these orphanages: Bethzatha, Mussie, and CHSFS Care Center” is described at <http://etfamilies.websitetoolbox.com/post?id=4590234&highlight=bethzatha&trail=150>

BFAS website claims relationship of sponsoring through Bethzata Children’s Home Association <http://betterfutureadoption.org/initiatives/sponsorship>

AGCI website confirms that they have operated from these Bethzata orphanages for years. <http://www.allgodschildren.org/orphancare2011/ethiopia/>

WACAP Bete saida 2008 placed an infant <http://miraculousmercy.blogspot.com/2008/07/i-just-got-off-phone-with-our-adoption.html>

Children’s Hope 1/28/11

<http://adopt.childrenshope.net/programs/ethiopia/updates/detail.php?ID=24686> “Currently Children’s Hope works with 4 orphanages throughout Ethiopia. Three of which we have worked with since just about the beginning of our work in Ethiopia. Numan Orphanage Center, Hope Community Services (HCS) and **Enat Alem**. The forth[sic], **Bethzatha Children’s Home**, has been placing children with us for about 1 ½ yrs. We are the only agency that Numan and HCS places children with; (As a reminder, HCS only places with mainstream Christian families). The other orphanages also place children with other agencies, not only CHI.”



March 30, 2011

Additionally, CHI has a waiting child photolisting site. As of 3/2/11, this site lists a child from **Bethzatha**. <http://www.chifamily.net/content/wvc/Ethiopia/PhotoList.htm>

Holt 2008 <http://holtinternational.org/blog/2008/05/children-meet-their-new-families/> “Some nannies are from the Durame Intake Center and some from **Bethzatha** Children’s Home Association, one of our in-country partners.”

Denmark agency 2009 reports “From a non US-agency it is reported that court dates are now given for abandoned children found in Addis Abeba from the orphanages Kids Care, Almaz Ashene and Sele Enat, and they expect more court dates.

The agency believes that five orphanages seem to be in focus: **Enat Alem**, **Betezata**, **Edget**, **Betesaida** and **Godanaw**, and that families with children here have to wait for the investigation to finish before getting court dates.

Unfortunately they have no news as to the status of the police investigation.”
<http://ethioadoptionnews.blogspot.com/2009/06/from-ac-denmark-agency-translated-from.html>

It must be pointed out that BFAS had its license pulled in 2011. So far they are the only agency to have that happen.

Fenot Lewogen

Hope website confirms they worked in Fenot Lewogen in 2007, the same year as issues occurred with Wereldkinderen adoptees
<http://www.childrenshopeint.org/ethiopia%20program%20updates.htm>

Case 13 of Fruits report indicates that children were also at Gelgela.

Enat Alem

Adoption Associates, Inc (Michigan) website confirms that they work in Enat Alem
http://www.adoptionassociates.net/news/minibuses_urgently_needed_in_ethiopia/

Children’s Hope 1/28/11
<http://adopt.childrenshope.net/programs/ethiopia/updates/detail.php?ID=24686> “Currently Children’s Hope works with 4 orphanages throughout Ethiopia. Three of which we have worked with since just about the beginning of our work in Ethiopia. Numan Orphanage Center, Hope Community Services (HCS) and **Enat Alem**. The fourth, **Bethzatha Children’s Home**, has been placing children with us for about 1 ½ yrs. We are the only agency that Numan and HCS places children with; (As a reminder, HCS only places with mainstream Christian families). The other orphanages also place children with other agencies, not only CHI”



March 30, 2011

Edget

Edget was the subject of the 2001 abandonment case ruling cited in the ACT report.

There is a German-run NGO called **Edget Baandnet Children Center** in Awassa

http://www.edget.org/index.php?page=home&hl=en_GB

and from <http://ethioadoptionnews.blogspot.com/2009/06/from-ac-denmark-agency-translated-from.html>

“**Edget** is located in the southern part of Addis Ababa, in the Nefas Silk-Lafto sub-city”

Denmark agency 2009 reports “From a non US-agency it is reported that court dates are now given for abandoned children found in Addis Abeba from the orphanages Kids Care, Almaz Ashene and Sele Enat, and they expect more court dates.

The agency believes that five orphanages seem to be in focus: **Enat Alem**, **Betezata**, **Edget**, **Betesaida** and **Godanaw**, and that families with children here have to wait for the investigation to finish before getting court dates.

Unfortunately they have no news as to the status of the police investigation.”

Birhan Family Welfare Foundation

Their website <http://berhanfoundation.org/default.html>

Godanaw

http://www.godanaw.org/en_organisation.html

Sign on the building “ Takes Adoption as the last option”...”Yes to Sponsors”..and...”Please Let me Stay with My Mother”

Additionally, there is this cryptic UNICEF document about **Godanaw**:
http://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/ET_youth_mulatu_CP.pdf

More Orphanages

The March 18 article by an Ethiopian-American (<http://ethiomeia.com/above/2284.html>) calls out the following 3 orphanages as continuing to process abandonments and questioning the ethics of it: **Kebebe Tsehay Orphanage**, **Ketchene Orphanage**, **Kolfe Youth Center**



March 30, 2011

These are the **same** orphanages indicated as continuing placements in the May 26, 2009 US DOS Alert

<http://pear-now.blogspot.com/2009/05/update-dos-alert-for-ethiopia-addis.html>

Adoptions of Abandoned Children Halted by Ethiopian Court

On May 4, 2009 the Ethiopian First Instance Court temporarily stopped accepting cases involving abandoned children referred by orphanages in Addis Ababa, citing a substantial increase in the number of children being brought for adoption. The number of abandoned children from orphanages in Addis Ababa has grown dramatically in recent months and Ethiopian authorities have become aware of possible cases of unethical practices associated with some of them.

Neither the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MOWA) nor the First Instance Court had been accepting abandonment cases from any orphanage in Addis Ababa pending an inquiry. However, on May 23 the Court confirmed that while the investigation into cases of abandoned children continues, it has begun accepting cases of abandoned children referred from Addis Ababa government orphanages. These include the following orphanages:

- **Kebebe Tsehay Orphanage**
- **Ketchene Orphanage**
- **Kolfe Youth Center**

Please continue to monitor adoption.state.gov for updated information on Ethiopia.

Source: <http://adoption.state.gov/news/ethiopia%20alert.html>"

All 3 orphanages seem to be linked to Gladney, with the first one also having humanitarian work by AAI (Washington).

Kebebe Tsehay Orphanage (Gladney Tsehai spelling)

<http://henokmoak.blogspot.com/2007/09/unexpected-surprise.html> and

<http://heartinafrica.blogspot.com/2007/07/kechene-orphanage.html>

http://adoptionsbygladney.com/html/whatsnew/art_humaneth_07.html

<http://theearleyjourney.blogspot.com/2007/03/reflections-of-our-days-in-ethiopia.html> (pictures of entrance-these APs also stopped at Ketchene orphanage-why?)

AAI (Washington) does humanitarian work at **Kebebe Tsehay**

<http://aainews.blogspot.com/2009/09/new-years-sheep-delivery.html>

Ketchene Orphanage (also **Kechene**) photos <http://www.121ethiopia.org/projects02.html> with Gladney http://adoptionsbygladney.com/html/whatsnew/art_humaneth_07.html



March 30, 2011

Kolfe Youth Center with Gladney

http://adoptionsbygladney.com/html/whatsnew/art_humaneth_07.html <http://wn.com/Kolfe> (note the woman has a black infant-she got her baby) <http://www.jobsdaughters.blogspot.com/>

Tying Things Together

The Australian exposé *Fly Away Children*

(<http://www.abc.net.au/foreign/content/2009/s2686908.htm>) on CWA seemed to go down the path of the “*bad apple agency*” theory. But the Fruits of Ethiopia report indicates that there is more than one kind of bad apple. This take place *at the orphanage level*, which is where many US agencies operate. Furthermore, many US agencies do not disclose who they work with, stating (on their websites) only that they work with multiple orphanages. Prospective adoptive parents have the right to know where the agencies are operating with before they sign on. This **basic information** should not have to be ferreted out by clients after they have paid large agency fees. Agencies must be held responsible for their chosen connections.

Important Conclusions

- **Harvesting was detected at multiple orphanages supplying “orphans” for US adoption agencies.**
- **Well-known, highly praised, long-in-Ethiopia, JCICS-affiliated agencies place from these orphanages.**
- **Manufactured abandonments were found at the orphanage level by re-using a document template.**
- **Serious questions about whether families of the children *in the adoption pipeline* are being offered family preservation programs or assistance.**
- **Many questions need to be asked to determine how ethical operations can take place from any of these orphanages at this time.**

